

## NATIONAL COPYCAT LANDSCAPE

*April 17, 2012*

On April 23, 2010, Arizona Governor Jan Brewer signed into law SB 1070, the nation's most punitive immigration legislation at the time. Since then, a number of states have considered passing similar "papers-please" racial profiling legislation. Despite the fact that some copycats were approved in a handful of states in 2011, many more of these bills failed across the country. The 2012 session has had even fewer states attempting to address immigration at the state level. The following is a summary of state legislation in 2012 and in years prior.

Since the legislative environment is constantly evolving, please refer to [www.nclr.org](http://www.nclr.org) for updated information and resources on state immigration legislation.

### Summary of 2011

- Since the passage of Arizona's SB 1070, 34 states have proposed similar bills and 29 have declined to advance. Twenty-five of those states rejected legislation in the 2011 session.
- Six states—Arizona, Utah, Indiana, Georgia, Alabama, and South Carolina—passed extreme and punitive SB 1070-style legislation. Provisions in all six of those laws have been blocked.

### Summary of 2012

- With many state legislative sessions coming to an end, no state has opted to pass punitive Arizona-style legislation in 2012.

### The following are states where Arizona- or Alabama-style bills have been defeated in the 2012 legislative session.

- In **Mississippi**, Representative Becky Currie introduced [HB 488](#), an Alabama-style anti-immigrant bill, on February 13. Though the bill was [approved](#) by the House of Representatives on March 15, HB 488 was [defeated](#) in the Senate when it [failed to move](#) out of Judiciary Committee B. HB 488 had received an unprecedented amount of pushback from the [faith, law enforcement](#), and [business community](#), and despite an attempt to resurrect the bill by amending HB 488 to another bill in the house, it [died a second and final time](#) on April 3.
- In **New Hampshire**, [HB 1494](#) died after testimony from law enforcement on the harm the bill would have on police relations with the Hispanic community; the Criminal Justice and Public Safety committee [voted 14–1](#) on February 7 to recommend killing a bill requiring police to check the immigration status of all arrested persons.
- In **Tennessee**, the Alabama-copycat bill HB 2191, introduced by Representative Shipley, died when it [was taken off notice](#) on February 7.
- In **Virginia**, the legislature rejected a number of anti-immigrant bills, including [SB 460](#), a "papers-please" bill introduced by Senator Rick Black. The bill [failed](#) to report out of the Courts of Justice on January 30, 2012.

- In **West Virginia**, Senators Barnes and Sypolt introduced [SB 64](#) on January 11. However, no action was taken on the bill after it was referred to the Senate Judiciary Committee, and the legislative session ended on March 13, 2012.

**The following are states where Arizona- or Alabama-style bills have been filed for the 2012 legislative session.**

- In **Kansas**, the home state of Kris Kobach, author of Arizona's SB 1070 and other papers-please laws, [HB 2578](#) was introduced on January 31. Although the law has received multiple hearings at the Committee on Federal and State Affairs, the bill has not yet moved out of the committee and the Kansas legislative session is scheduled to end on May 25.
- In **Missouri**, State Sen. Will Kraus introduced [SB 590](#), a "papers-please" bill that also [mandates](#) that all public schools verify the immigration status of enrollees. As Missouri faces a [\\$704 million shortfall](#) in fiscal year 2012, state legislators are currently pursuing a costly and short-sighted anti-immigrant law. The costs associated with the bill are unknown because the [fiscal note](#) attached to it is [woefully incomplete](#).
- In **Michigan**, Representative Dave Agema's [HB 4305](#) was carried over from 2011. However, a report from the Michigan League for Human Services detailing how the [law would hurt Michigan's economy](#), along with statements from Republican Governor Rick Snyder also about how the bill would [hurt the state](#), have left the bill untouched in 2012.
- Although the **North Carolina** legislative session has not yet begun, legislators have already begun to [debate](#) immigration. Their conversations, however, have indicated that they are [not likely](#) to address immigration when they begin their 2012 session in May.
- In **Pennsylvania**, [HB 738](#) carried over from the 2011 session. The bill was introduced by Representative Daryl Metcalfe, the founder of State Legislators for Legal Immigration,\* on March 5. As similar bill, [HB 2479](#), failed to move in 2010.
- In **Wisconsin**, Representative Don Pridemore's [AB 173](#) was carried over from the 2011 legislative session. The bill was introduced on June 8, 2011 and it was referred to the Committee on Homeland Security and State Affairs. The 2012 session ends on May 30.

**In the following states, the legislature refused to consider or move forward with an Arizona-style bill in previous legislative sessions.**

- In **Arkansas** in 2010, the group Secure Arkansas [failed to attain](#) the 77,468 signatures needed to put the measure on the November 2010 ballot.
- In 2011, **California** Assemblyman Tim Donnelly's [AB 26](#) was rejected in committee on April 5 by a [7-3 vote](#).
- In 2011, **Colorado** Representative Randy Baumgardner pulled HB 1107 [before it had even been heard](#). Senator Kent Lambert also filed [SB 54](#) in the Senate, but the measure failed after several leaders in the state, including Democratic Governor John Hickenlooper and [notable law enforcement officers](#), stated opposition to the bill.
- In 2010, **Florida** Senator Paula Dockery and Representative Kevin Ambler [pushed for the consideration of Arizona-like legislation](#) in a 2010 special session, but they were

---

\* [State Legislators for Legal Immigration](#) (SLLI) has a "working partnership" with [Federation for American Immigration Reform](#) (FAIR); SLLI members rely on FAIR to produce model legislation for them to use at the state level, such as in the case of Arizona's SB 1070.

unable to gain the two-thirds approval needed to bring up the legislation. In 2011, thanks to organized opposition from [religious](#), business, and [immigrant rights](#) efforts, the state legislature failed to pass [HB 7089](#), an Arizona copycat, and [SB 2040](#) before the end of its legislative session on May 6.

- In **Iowa** in 2011, [SF 102](#) and [HF 27](#) are dead as they failed to move before March 11, the “funnel date” for bills to pass out of their originating chamber.
- In 2010, **Illinois** Representative Ramey filed HB 6937 on November 3, which failed to move after being introduced. In 2011, Representative Ramey again failed to move [HB 1969](#) by the end of 2011.
- In 2010, the **Kansas** House of Representatives [rejected](#) their Arizona-copycat legislation on procedural grounds. In 2011, after multiple [failed attempts](#) to pass a bill through the House Judiciary Committee, the House refused to bring Representative Lance Kinzer’s HB 2372 to the floor by a vote of 84–40. The failure of this copycat bill is particularly notable as Kansas is the home state of Kris Kobach, attorney for the Immigration Law Reform Institute\* and one of the authors of Arizona SB 1070, who was also elected Kansas Secretary of State in 2010. The bill drew criticism from legislators and prominent [business](#) groups.
- In **Kentucky**, Senator John Schickel’s SB 6 was passed [out of the Senate](#) in early January 2011. However, the bill was [rejected](#) in the House Local Government Committee after a fiscal-impact statement estimated the bill to cost the state [\\$89 million](#) per year.
- In 2010, **Louisiana** Representative Ernest Wooton withdrew [HB 411](#) from consideration after the bill was found to [cost \\$11 million](#). In the 2010 session, the Louisiana legislature had already defeated [HB 1205](#), introduced by Representative Joe Harrison, which would have required state agencies and local governments to verify the citizenship status of all people who apply for public benefits and further criminalized the employment or transportation of illegal immigrants. This measure was [defeated](#) with the help of associations such as the Louisiana Association of Business and Industry, the Catholic Bishops, the National Federation of Independent Business, and Associated Builders and Contractors.
- In fall 2010, **Maryland**’s Frederick County Commissioners wanted to introduce SB 1070 copycat legislation to the state house, but it was [defeated](#) at the commissioner level and failed to reach the state house.
- In 2011, **Maine** State Representative Kathy Chase [pulled](#) her proposal, [LD 1496](#), before it was even heard at the committee level.
- In 2010, [H 6256](#) and [S 1388](#), introduced by **Michigan** Representative Meltzer and Senators McManus, Cropsey, Allen, and Brown in June, did not move before the 2010 legislative session ended on September 30.
- In **Minnesota**, [HB 3830](#) was introduced by Representative Steve Drazkowski on May 6 and was referred to the Public Safety and Oversight Committee when the legislative session ended without further discussion.
- In the **Mississippi** Senate, Senator Joey Fillingane’s [SB 2179](#) was passed on January 18 and a changed version of the bill [passed](#) out of the House on January 28. However, the

---

\* The [Immigration Law Reform Institute](#) is the legal arm of FAIR, which is designated a hate group by the [Southern Poverty Law Center](#).

bill was proclaimed “dead” on March 29, as the chambers failed to agree on a single version.

- **Nebraska’s** Unicameral Legislature agreed to [shelve](#) Senator Charlie Janssen’s [LB 48](#) after the proposal was found only to have [two solid votes out of five](#) needed to advance it from the Judiciary Committee to the full Legislature.
- In **Nevada**, [AB 430](#), introduced by Assemblyman Ira Hansen, died quietly as it failed to meet the state’s [legislative deadline](#). In 2010, Chad Christensen was also unable to attain the signatures needed for the initiative to reach the 2010 ballot. He also attempted to call a special session to vote on the bill, but that too was [rejected](#).
- In the **New Hampshire** House of Representatives, the Committee on Criminal Justice and Public Safety [voted unanimously](#) to kill HB 644.
- In **North Carolina**, Representative George Cleveland introduced [HB 343](#) on March 14, but the bill failed to pass out of the originating chamber before the designated “crossover” date. [SJ 1349](#) was introduced by Senator Don East, which would have allowed for the consideration of an Arizona-like bill. East’s resolution stalled in the Senate rules committee and North Carolina’s 2010 legislative session ended.
- In 2011, **Ohio** Senator Jimmy Stewart introduced [HB 98](#).
- In **Oklahoma**, despite advancing a bill that legislators called “Arizona-plus,” as it would have allowed police to confiscate the property of those found to be in the country illegally, the House [rejected](#) the bill by a vote of 62–31 on May 17, in part due to [tensions](#) that the bill created within the Republican Party.
- In **South Dakota**, the House State Affairs Committee [rejected](#) an Arizona-style bill by a vote of 11–2 after hearing from law enforcement groups and others who work with immigrants.
- In **Tennessee**, the Arizona-copycat legislation introduced by Senator Bill Ketron (SB 0780) and Representative Joe Carr ([HB 1380](#)) was rejected due to a [fiscal note](#) released by the Tennessee General Assembly Fiscal Review Committee showing that the bills would increase state expenditures by nearly \$3 million for the first year and over \$1.8 million in each subsequent year.
- In **Texas**, Republican Governor Rick Perry pushed for “sanctuary cities” as one of his “[emergency items](#)” at the start of the 2011 legislative session and allowed it to be addressed in a [special session](#) after it [failed](#) in the regular session. On June 28, the legislature adjourned its special session without approving the legislation (HB 9 and SB 9), rejecting it twice in 2011 alone.
- In **Rhode Island**, House Speaker Gordon Fox [decided](#) that [HB 8142](#), Representative Peter Palumbo’s copycat bill, would not be heard in the 2010 legislative session.
- After **Virginia’s** Arizona-like bill, HB 2332, was revived and passed the House of Delegates on February 8, it was [rejected](#) at the subcommittee level along with numerous other anti-immigrant provisions on February 17.
- In **Washington**, Senator Val Stevens introduced [SB 5338](#) on January 20, but the bill died when the session ended on May 25.
- In **Wyoming**, HB 94 [died](#) when no member of the House Minerals, Business, and Economic Development Committee moved to vote on the bill.